

From: Hannan, Richard
To: Heath, Becki L -FS
Cc: Hotaling, Richard; Davis, Ellen -FS; grizz@umontana.edu; van Manen, Frank; Bailey, Paula J -FS; bakernrb@dfw.wa.gov; Bob Everitt; Bonnie.Scott@pc.gc.ca; Brian Nesvik; Caroline Weinberger; Iverson, Chris -FS; csmithwmi@msn.com; Chris Tunnoch; Claudia Regan; Cooper, Shoshana M -FS; cynthia_barry@fws.gov; Schmid, David -FS; Dave.McDonough@pc.gc.ca; Deb Frauson; Denise Shultz; Dustin Miller; Eric Gardner; Farnsworth, Mary -FS; Ferebee, Brian -FS; Gregg Losinski (glosinski@idfg.idaho.gov); Hamilton, Cherie E -FS; Harv Forsgren (hlforsgren@aol.com); Hojem, Randy -FS; Hollen, Debbie A -FS; Irene Goldenberger; Jack Oelfke; Jake Chaffin; Jamie Connell@blm.gov; Jennifer Fortin-Noreus; Jennifer Harsha; Jim Allen; Jim Unsworth; Jiron, Daniel -FS; jkershner@usgs.gov; Jodi_Bush@fws.gov; Johnston, Eric -FS; Karen_Taylor-Goodrich@nps.gov; Forthofer, Kelly J -FS; King, Julie K -FS; kmcdonald@mt.gov; Koppenol, Patricia -FS; Lee, Kristine M -FS; Kym Hall; Lauri Hanauska-Brown; Lorna Smith (lorna@westernwildlife.org); Mahalovich, Mary F -FS; mark_haroldson@usgs.gov; Marten, Leanne -FS; Matt Hogan; mboyer@idfg.idaho.gov; McDonald, Peter M -FS; Michael Thabault; mike_wrigley@nps.gov; Moore, Carol J -FS; Mucklow, Debbie -FS; Paul Frame; Phil Wilson; Rasure, Nora -FS; Richard_Hotaling@blm.gov; Ron.Bjorge@gov.ab.ca; Sams, Jon E -FS; Jackson, Scott -FS; Scott Talbott (scott.talbott@wyo.gov); Sheridan Todd (sheridan.todd@wyo.gov); Smelser, Garth -FS; Sterling Miller; Steven_Ellis@blm.gov; Tabitha Graves (tgraves@usgs.gov); tammy_whittington@nps.gov; Theresa Rabot; Tony.Hamilton@gov.bc.ca; Tyers, Daniel -FS; Virgil Moore
Subject: Re: Jackson Hole News & Guide 9/16/15
Date: Monday, September 21, 2015 1:07:39 PM
Attachments: image004.png
image003.png
image001.png
image002.png

I was not contacted, but then again, I am no bear expert. rich

Richard Hannan
Deputy Regional Director
Pacific Region
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
911 NE 11th Avenue
Portland, OR 97232-4181
503/231-6119

On Mon, Sep 21, 2015 at 12:01 PM, Heath, Becki L -FS <blheath@fs.fed.us> wrote:

Me either



Becki Lockett Heath
Deputy Regional Forester
Forest Service

Pacific Northwest Region

p: 503-808-2202
c: 503-593-8425
f: 503-808-2210
blheath@fs.fed.us

1220 SW 3rd
Portland, OR 97204
www.fs.fed.us
The logo of the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA), featuring a stylized tree and the words "USDA" and "DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE".

Caring for the land and serving people

From: Hotaling, Richard [mailto:rhotalin@blm.gov]
Sent: Monday, September 21, 2015 10:14 AM
To: Davis, Ellen -FS
Cc: grizz@umontana.edu; van Manen, Frank; Bailey, Paula J -FS; bakernrb@dfw.wa.gov; Bob Everitt; Bonnie.Scott@pc.gc.ca; Brian Nesvik; Caroline Weinberger; Iverson, Chris -FS; csmithwmi@msn.com; Chris Tunnoch; Claudia Regan; Cooper, Shoshana M -FS; cynthia_barry@fws.gov; Schmid, David -FS; Dave.McDonough@pc.gc.ca; Deb Frauson; Denise Shultz; Dustin Miller; Eric Gardner; Farnsworth, Mary -FS; Ferebee, Brian -FS; Gregg Losinski (glosinski@idfg.idaho.gov); Hamilton, Cherie E -FS; Harv Forsgren (hlforsgren@aol.com); Heath, Becki L -FS; Hojem, Randy -FS; Hollen, Debbie A -FS; Irene Goldenberger; Jack Oelfke; Jake Chaffin; Jamie Connell@blm.gov; Jennifer Fortin-Noreus; Jennifer Harsha; Jim Allen; Jim Unsworth; Jiron, Daniel -FS; jkershner@usgs.gov; Jodi_Bush@fws.gov; Johnston, Eric -FS; Karen_Taylor-Goodrich@nps.gov; Forthofer, Kelly J -FS; King, Julie K -FS; kmcdonald@mt.gov; Koppenol, Patricia -FS; Lee, Kristine M -FS; Kym Hall; Lauri Hanauska-Brown; Lorna Smith (lorna@westernwildlife.org); Mahalovich, Mary F -FS; mark_haroldson@usgs.gov; Marten, Leanne -FS; Matt Hogan; mboyer@idfg.idaho.gov; McDonald, Peter M -FS; Michael Thabault; mike_wrigley@nps.gov; Moore, Carol J -FS; Mucklow, Debbie -FS; Paul Frame; Phil Wilson; Rasure, Nora -FS; richard_hannan@fws.gov; Richard_Hotaling@blm.gov; Ron.Bjorge@gov.ab.ca; Sams, Jon E -FS; Jackson, Scott -FS; Scott Talbott (scott.talbott@wyo.gov); Sheridan Todd (sheridan.todd@wyo.gov); Smelser, Garth -FS; Sterling Miller; Steven_Ellis@blm.gov; Tabitha Graves (tgraves@usgs.gov); tammy_whittington@nps.gov; Theresa Rabot; Tony.Hamilton@gov.bc.ca; Tyers, Daniel -FS; Virgil Moore
Subject: Re: Jackson Hole News & Guide 9/16/15

I wasn't contacted and did not respond. Thanks. RMH

Richard M. "Rick" Hotaling
District Manager, Western Montana District
106 North Parkmont
Butte, MT 59701

(406) 533-7629 Work
(406) 490-0301 Cell
(406) 533-7660 Fax

rhotalin@blm.gov

"That which you face can only lift you up, it's when you turn around that you're thrown to the ground."

On Fri, Sep 18, 2015 at 11:28 AM, Davis, Ellen -FS <ellendavis@fs.fed.us> wrote:

That is a really good question, who did respond? We can't seem to find anyone IGBC is involved with who did respond. Gregg and I were asking the same question. It sounds like YES may do an official response noting that the top experts and scientists involved in Yellowstone and grizzly bear recovery did not respond with input and would not agree with her Thesis. Gregg may be able to elaborate further on a plan of action but sure seems like a coordinated response is needed.

Ellen L. Davis
Executive Coordinator, Interagency Grizzly Bear Committee (IGBC)
Forest Service
Northern Region, Regional Office
p: 406-329-3434
f: 406-329-3171
ellendavis@fs.fed.us
200 East Broadway
Missoula, MT 59807
www.fs.fed.us

Caring for the land and serving people

-----Original Message-----

From: Servheen, Chris [mailto:grizz@umontana.edu]
Sent: Friday, September 18, 2015 10:08 AM
To: van Manen, Frank; Davis, Ellen -FS
Cc: Bailey, Paula J -FS; bakernrb@dfw.wa.gov; Bob Everitt; Bonnie.Scott@pc.gc.ca; Brian Nesvik; Caroline Weinberger; Iverson, Chris -FS; grizz@umontana.edu; csmithwmi@msn.com; Chris Tunnoch; Claudia Regan; Cooper, Shoshana M -FS; cynthia_barry@fws.gov; Schmid, David -FS; Dave.McDonough@pc.gc.ca; Deb Frauson; Denise Shultz; Dustin Miller; Eric Gardner; Farnsworth, Mary -FS; Ferebee, Brian -FS; Gregg Losinski (glosinski@idfg.idaho.gov); Hamilton, Cherie E -FS; Harv Forsgren (hlforsgren@aol.com); Heath, Becki L -FS; Hojem, Randy -FS; Hollen, Debbie A -FS; Irene Goldenberger; Jack Oelfke; Jake Chaffin; Jamie_Connell@blm.gov; Jennifer Fortin-Noreus; Jennifer Harsha; Jim Allen; Jim Unsworth; Jiron, Daniel -FS; jkershner@usgs.gov; Jodi_Bush@fws.gov; Johnston, Eric -FS; Karen_Taylor-Goodrich@nps.gov; Forthofer, Kelly J -FS; King, Julie K -FS; kmcdonald@mt.gov; Koppenol, Patricia -FS; Lee, Kristine M -FS; Kym Hall; Lauri Hanauska-Brown; Lorna Smith (lorna@westernwildlife.org); Mahalovich, Mary F -FS; mark_haroldson@usgs.gov; Marten, Leanne -FS; Matt Hogan; mboyer@idfg.idaho.gov; McDonald, Peter M -FS; Michael Thabault; mike_wrigley@nps.gov; Moore, Carol J -FS; Mucklow, Debbie -FS; Paul Frame; Phil Wilson; Rasure, Nora -FS; richard_hannan@fws.gov; Richard_Hotaling@blm.gov; Ron.Bjorge@gov.ab.ca; Sams, Jon E -FS; Jackson, Scott -FS; Scott Talbott (scott.talbott@wyo.gov); Sheridan Todd (sheridan.todd@wyo.gov); Smelser, Garth -FS; Sterling Miller; Steven_Ellis@blm.gov; Tabitha Graves (tgraves@usgs.gov); tammy_whittington@nps.gov; Theresa Rabot; Tony.Hamilton@gov.bc.ca; Tyers, Daniel -FS; Virgil Moore
Subject: Re: Jackson Hole News & Guide 9/16/15

Frank is correct. I do not know of anyone who currently or recently has worked on Yellowstone grizzly bear research or recovery who participated in this. So, who did answer these questions?

From: 'Frank van Manen' <fvanmanen@usgs.gov> [mailto:fvanmanen@usgs.gov]
Date: Friday, September 18, 2015 at 10:01 AM
To: Ellen Davis <ellendavis@fs.fed.us> [mailto:ellendavis@fs.fed.us]
Cc: Paula Bailey <pjbailey@fs.fed.us> [mailto:pjbailey@fs.fed.us], "bakernrb@dfw.wa.gov" [mailto:bakernrb@dfw.wa.gov], "Bob.Everitt@dfw.wa.gov" [mailto:Bob.Everitt@dfw.wa.gov], "Bonnie.Scott@pc.gc.ca" [mailto:Bonnie.Scott@pc.gc.ca], "brian.nesvik@wyo.gov" [mailto:brian.nesvik@wyo.gov], Caroline Weinberger <caroline.weinberger@wyo.gov> [mailto:caroline.weinberger@wyo.gov], Chris Iverson <civerson@fs.fed.us> [mailto:civerson@fs.fed.us], Chris Servheen <grizz@umontana.edu> [mailto:grizz@umontana.edu], Chris Smith <csmithwmi@msn.com> [mailto:csmithwmi@msn.com], Chris Tunnoch <chris.tunnoch@gov.bc.ca> [mailto:chris.tunnoch@gov.bc.ca], Claudia Regan <cregan@usgs.gov> [mailto:cregan@usgs.gov], "Cooper, Shoshana M -FS" <smcooper@fs.fed.us> [mailto:smcooper@fs.fed.us], "cynthia_barry@fws.gov" [mailto:cynthia_barry@fws.gov], "David Schmid" <dschmid@fs.fed.us> [mailto:dschmid@fs.fed.us], "Dave.McDonough@pc.gc.ca" [mailto:Dave.McDonough@pc.gc.ca], "Deb.Frauson@nps.gov" [mailto:Deb.Frauson@nps.gov], Denise Shultz <denise_m_shultz@nps.gov> [mailto:denise_m_shultz@nps.gov], Dustin Miller <dustin.miller@osc.idaho.gov> [mailto:dustin.miller@osc.idaho.gov], Eric Gardner <eric.gardner@dfw.wa.gov> [mailto:eric.gardner@dfw.wa.gov], Mary Farnsworth <mfarnsworth@fs.fed.us> [mailto:mfarnsworth@fs.fed.us], Brian Ferebee <bferebee@fs.fed.us> [mailto:bferebee@fs.fed.us], Gregg Losinski <glosinski@idfg.idaho.gov> [mailto:glosinski@idfg.idaho.gov],

"Hamilton, Cherie E -FS" <cehamilton@fs.fed.us<mailto:cehamilton@fs.fed.us>>, "hlforsgren@aol.com" <hlforsgren@aol.com<mailto:hlforsgren@aol.com>>, Becki Heath <blheath@fs.fed.us<mailto:blheath@fs.fed.us>>, Randy Hojem <rhojem@fs.fed.us<mailto:rhojem@fs.fed.us>>, "Hollen, Debbie A -FS" <dahollen@fs.fed.us<mailto:dahollen@fs.fed.us>>, Irene Goldenberger <irene.goldenberger@dfw.wa.gov<mailto:irene.goldenberger@dfw.wa.gov>>, "Jack_Oelfke@Nps.Gov" <Jack_Oelfke@Nps.Gov>>, "Jack_oelfke@nps.gov" <jack_oelfke@nps.gov>>, Jake Chaffin <jlchaffi@blm.gov<mailto:jlchaffi@blm.gov>>, "Jamie_Connell@blm.gov" <Jamie_Connell@blm.gov>>, "Jennifer.fortin-noreus@umontana.edu" <jennifer.fortin-noreus@umontana.edu>>, "Jennifer.fortin-noreus@umontana.edu" <jennifer.fortin-noreus@umontana.edu>>, Jim Allen <james.allen@gov.ab.ca<mailto:james.allen@gov.ab.ca>>, Jim Unsworth <jim.unsworth@dfw.wa.gov<mailto:jim.unsworth@dfw.wa.gov>>, Daniel Jiron <djiron@fs.fed.us<mailto:djiron@fs.fed.us>>, Jeffrey Kershner <jkershner@usgs.gov<mailto:jkershner@usgs.gov>>, "jodi_bush@fws.gov" <jodi_bush@fws.gov>>, Eric Johnston <ejohnston@fs.fed.us<mailto:ejohnston@fs.fed.us>>, "Karen_Taylor-Goodrich@nps.gov" <Karen_Taylor-Goodrich@nps.gov>>, Kelly Forthofer <kforthofer@fs.fed.us<mailto:kforthofer@fs.fed.us>>, Julie King <jking@fs.fed.us<mailto:jking@fs.fed.us>>, Ken McDonald <kmcdonald@mt.gov<mailto:kmcdonald@mt.gov>>, "Koppenol, Patricia -FS" <pkoppenol@fs.fed.us<mailto:pkoppenol@fs.fed.us>>, "Lee, Kristine M -FS" <kristinelee@fs.fed.us<mailto:kristinelee@fs.fed.us>>, Kym Hall <Kym_Hall@nps.gov<mailto:Kym_Hall@nps.gov>>, Lauri Hanauska-Brown <lhanauska-brown@mt.gov<mailto:lhanauska-brown@mt.gov>>, Lorna Smith <lorna@westernwildlife.org<mailto:lorna@westernwildlife.org>>, Mary Mahalovich <mmahalovich@fs.fed.us<mailto:mmahalovich@fs.fed.us>>, Mark Haroldson <mark.haroldson@usgs.gov<mailto:mark.haroldson@usgs.gov>>, "Marten, Leanne - FS" <lmarten@fs.fed.us<mailto:lmarten@fs.fed.us>>, Matt Hogan <matt_hogan@fws.gov<mailto:matt_hogan@fws.gov>>, "mboyer@idfg.idaho.gov" <mboyer@idfg.idaho.gov>>, "McDonald, Peter M -FS" <petermcdonald@fs.fed.us<mailto:petermcdonald@fs.fed.us>>, "Michael_Thabault@fws.gov" <Michael_Thabault@fws.gov>>, "Mike_Wrigley@nps.gov" <mike_wrigley@nps.gov>>, "Carol Moore" <cjmoore@fs.fed.us<mailto:cjmoore@fs.fed.us>>, Debbie Mucklow <dmucklow@fs.fed.us<mailto:dmucklow@fs.fed.us>>, Paul Frame <paul.frame@gov.ab.ca<mailto:paul.frame@gov.ab.ca>>, Phil Wilson <phil_wilson@nps.gov<mailto:phil_wilson@nps.gov>>, Nora Rasure <nrasure@fs.fed.us<mailto:nrasure@fs.fed.us>>, "Richard_hannan@fws.gov" <Richard_hannan@fws.gov>>, "Richard_Hotaling@blm.gov" <Richard_Hotaling@blm.gov>>, "Ron.Bjorge@gov.ab.ca" <Ron.Bjorge@gov.ab.ca<mailto:Ron.Bjorge@gov.ab.ca>>, Jon Sams <jesams@fs.fed.us<mailto:jesams@fs.fed.us>>, Scott Jackson <sjackson03@fs.fed.us<mailto:sjackson03@fs.fed.us>>, Scott Talbott <scott.talbott@wyo.gov<mailto:scott.talbott@wyo.gov>>, Sheridan Todd <sheridan.todd@wyo.gov<mailto:sheridan.todd@wyo.gov>>, Garth Smelser <gsmelser@fs.fed.us<mailto:gsmelser@fs.fed.us>>, Sterling Miller <sterlingmil@gmail.com<mailto:sterlingmil@gmail.com>>, "Steven_Ellis@blm.gov" <Steven_Ellis@blm.gov>>, "Tabitha Graves" <tgraves@usgs.gov<mailto:tgraves@usgs.gov>>, "Tammy_Whittington@nps.gov" <Tammy_Whittington@nps.gov>>, Theresa Rabot <theresa_rabot@fws.gov<mailto:theresa_rabot@fws.gov>>, Tony Hamilton <Tony.Hamilton@gov.bc.ca<mailto:Tony.Hamilton@gov.bc.ca>>, Dan Tyers <dtyers@fs.fed.us<mailto:dtyers@fs.fed.us>>, Virgil Moore <virgil.moore@idfg.idaho.gov<mailto:virgil.moore@idfg.idaho.gov>>

Subject: Re: FW: Jackson Hole News & Guide 9/16/15

Hi Ellen,

These are good questions to ask. I will speak on behalf of the IGBST. Everyone on the IGBST was contacted by these researchers and several of us exchanged emails with them to get more details. The survey appeared to be poorly designed and seemed to be leading towards a particular advocacy position. I don't think anyone on our team responded. Additionally, for those of use with the USGS, we don't participate in surveys regarding policy issues.

Best regards,

Frank

Frank T. van Manen

Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team

U.S. Geological Survey

Northern Rocky Mountain Science Center

2327 University Way, Suite 2
Bozeman, MT 59715

Phone 406-994-5043

<http://nrmcs.usgs.gov/research/igbst-home.htm>

On Fri, Sep 18, 2015 at 9:41 AM, Davis, Ellen -FS <ellendavis@fs.fed.us<mailto:ellendavis@fs.fed.us>> wrote:

Hi all, see email from Gregg below and attached Masters Thesis by student Harmony Szarek. The Thesis documents that grizzly bear management experts were contacted to take a survey. We are very interested to know who was contacted.

If you were contacted, please let us know how and by whom you were contacted. Also, please feel free to forward this on to any other folks we might want to hear from. Thanks so much. Ellen

[Forest Service Shield]

Ellen L. Davis
Executive Coordinator, Interagency Grizzly Bear Committee (IGBC)

Forest Service
Northern Region, Regional Office

p: 406-329-3434
f: 406-329-3171
ellendavis@fs.fed.us<mailto:ellendavis@fs.fed.us>

200 East Broadway
Missoula, MT 59807
www.fs.fed.us<<http://www.fs.fed.us>>
[USDA Logo]<<http://usda.gov/>>[Forest Service Twitter]<[https://twitter.com/forestservice](https://twitter.com/forestsservice)>[USDA Facebook]<<http://facebook.com/USDA>>

Caring for the land and serving people

From: Losinski, Gregg [mailto:gregg.losinski@idfg.idaho.gov<mailto:gregg.losinski@idfg.idaho.gov>]
Sent: Thursday, September 17, 2015 2:38 PM
To: Davis, Ellen -FS
Subject: FW: Jackson Hole News & Guide 9/16/15

Ellen- FYI -How many members are there in IGBC?
Survey: Experts favor federal griz protection

Perceived threats are far-ranging, master's student candidate finds.
[How do the experts think Yellowstone grizzlies should be managed?]
<<http://t.sidekickopen03.com/e1t/c/5/f18dQhb0S7lC8dDMPbW2n0x6l2B9nMJW7t5XZs7fsFH6W1pgFy03M2hXHW64zBkx56dL-zf1f1jjs02?t=&si=5360944466624512&pi=29f8ba41-c9f3-4139-983e-e782e0c2adc7>>

KATHRYN HOLLOWAY / NEWS&GUIDE

POSTED: WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 16, 2015 4:30 AM

By Mike Koshmrl | 0
comments<http://t.sidekickopen03.com/e1t/c/5/f18dQhb0S7lC8dDMPbW2n0x6l2B9nMJW7t5XZs7fsFH6W1pgFy03M2hXHW64zBkx56dL-zf1f1jjs02?t=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.jhnewsandguide.com%2Fnews%2Fenvironmental%2Fsurvey-experts-favorfederal-griz-protection%2Farticle_65fdda5a-7c07-5fc3-953e-f9e149af30e8.html&si=5360944466624512&pi=29f8ba41-c9f3-4139-983e-e782e0c2adc7>

As the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service eyes the end of federal protection for the ecosystem's grizzly bears, an academic study finds that bear experts would prefer that the protections stay in place.

An Ohio State University master's student, Harmony Szarek, found in her thesis that nearly two in three grizzly bear experts familiar with the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem's population recommend that the region's bears either maintain their current "threatened" status or be elevated to a more protected "endangered" level under the Endangered Species Act.

"Of those experts who felt qualified to respond to the item about the appropriate Endangered Species Act listing status for the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem grizzly," Szarek wrote, "a clear majority indicated that bears should remain listed under the Endangered Species Act.

"Currently, there appears to be political pressure to delist this population segment," she wrote. "However, responses here indicate that a majority of experts believe delisting would be an incorrect decision, or at the least a violation of the precautionary principle."

The grizzly experts' views on the bears' Endangered Species Act status came as a "shock," Ohio State University social science professor Jeremy Bruskotter said.

"We weren't anticipating that at all," said Bruskotter, Szarek's advisor and the study's lead investigator. "We anticipated that at the most it would be a 50-50 split.

"Initially when we saw the data, we thought, 'This can be explained,'" Bruskotter said. "We thought that's probably the people who are least familiar with the situation."

But that wasn't the case. There was "really no variation" in listing views between those who worked closely with Greater Yellowstone grizzlies and those unfamiliar with the population, Bruskotter said.

"The listing status judgment was the same whether or not they had specific knowledge ... or whether they really had no knowledge at all that was specific to that population," he said.

Szarek, a student in Ohio State's graduate program in environment and natural resources, also sought to determine how heuristics — decision-making shortcuts — influenced experts' recommendations for the ecosystem's grizzlies.

Professor Eric Toman also contributed to and advised on the research.

The title of the thesis, which Szarek defended in April, is a mouthful: "Subjectivity in expert decision making: Risk assessment, acceptability, and cognitive heuristics affecting Endangered Species Act listing judgments for the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem grizzly bear."

Those whose email address could be found were contacted, and nearly 600 of the messages sent out were opened. Two hundred and thirty-four people took the survey, providing the data for the analysis.

Contact Mike Koshmrl at 732-7067 or environmental@jhnewsandguide.com <mailto:environmental@jhnewsandguide.com>.